UNITED NATIONS ENVIRONMENT PROGRAMMME/GLOBAL ENVIRONMENT FACILITY
SUBPROJECT GF/ 2200-97-58

ENABLING ACTIVITIES FOR THE PREPARATION OF INITIAL NATIONAL COMMUNICATIONS RELATED TO THE UNITED NATIONS FRAMEWORK CONVENTION ON CLIMATE CHANGE IN DJIBOUTI

EVALUATION REPORT

Adeyemi Franck ATTERE

Evaluation and Oversight Unit
October 2002

K0263368 041202

Contents

Acronyms

CCEA	Climate Change Enabling Activities
UNEP/DEWA	Division for Early Warning and Assessment
UNEP/DPDL	Division of Policy Development and Law
ENDA	Environment and Development in the Third World
GEF	Global Environment Facility
IGAD	Intergovernmental Authority for Development
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
NCCC	National Climate Change Committee
PERSGA	Regional Organization for the Conservation of the Red Sea and the Gulf of Aden
ROA	UNEP Regional Office for Africa
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNITAR	United Nations Institute for Training and Research

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am most grateful for the assistance, cooperation and contribution of the project management team and the members of the study teams I met, especially the Director of Environment, Mr. Mohamed Ali Moumin, the Project Coordinator, Mr. Moussa Ahmed Hassan and Mr. Jalludin Mohamed and Mr. Nabil Mohamed of the National Curriculum Development Centre.

I note with gratitude the special contribution of the Acting Chief, Evaluation and Oversight Unit of the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), Mr. Segbedzi Norgbey, the Task Manager, Enabling Activities, Mr. Ravi Sharma and the Fund Manager, Mr. Victor Ogbuneke.

Finally, I express my sincere thanks to Ms. Mela Shah and Ms. Rahab Gachoya of the Evaluation and Oversight Unit for their significant assistance during the entire period of the evaluation.

Executive summary

1. The evaluation of the UNEP/GEF subproject GF/ 2200-97-58 entitled "Enabling Activities for the Preparation of Initial National Communications Related to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) in Djibouti" was undertaken during the period 1 September 2002 - 30 October 2002. The project was planned for 24 months, starting from March 1999 to February 2001, but lasted until December 2001.

2. The project was funded by the Global Environment Facility (GEF) to assist Djibouti in undertaking the following activities: to develop the greenhouse gas inventory based on the 1994 base year; to identify and assess mitigation options; to develop a comprehensive vulnerability assessment for various sectors; to identify stage I adaptation options; to build capacity to integrate climate change concerns into planning; and to provide public awareness and other information.

3. The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change commits Parties to the Convention to certain reporting obligations and requested GEF to provide financial support for the preparation of the required national communications from non-Annex 1 Parties.

4. UNEP, as one of the implementing agencies of GEF, is committed, inter alia, to facilitating the process of preparation, compilation, and consideration of the communications and to ensuring that the Conference of the Parties has sufficient information to carry out its responsibilities to assess the overall effects of the steps taken by the Parties and to assess the implementation of the Convention.

5. The main objective of this evaluation was to assess the project outputs and results in terms of relevance, appropriateness, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability. The purpose of the evaluation was to determine the extent to which the project had been successful in fulfilling its objectives and obtaining the expected results in a cost-effective manner.

6. The consultant reviewed documentation provided by the project management team and travelled to Djibouti to meet and discuss with several contributors to the project and to the final document.

7. Following the ratification of the Convention by the Government of Djibouti on 27 August 1995 and the coming into force of the Convention, the project was to make available $310,000 over two years to enable Djibouti to fulfill its reporting requirements under the Convention. A task manager at UNEP was at the disposal of the national project team for backstopping. However, the national project team and the national implementing agency were given full control over the implementation of the project.

8. The activities undertaken by Djibouti within the framework of the project included the development of a national greenhouse gas inventory and assessment of the vulnerability of some sectors. The activities help Djibouti to begin to identify and evaluate mitigation and adaptation measures that could form the basis of future strategies and action plans. The activities generated data for the various sectors studied. Most importantly, they helped to identify major data gaps.

9. The Djibouti project was appropriate and consistent with the programme and the mandate of UNEP and also contributed to a large extent to the objectives of the Convention and of GEF. The project conducted nine activities during which the project management team and the national study teams were established during the period May- September 1999. The teams carried out various studies. A total number of 13 consultants, 10 national and three international, were involved in the implementation of the project. The most important activity during this phase was carried out by eight consultants who investigated greenhouse gas emissions from some processes and sources in three sectors, namely, energy, industries, transport; agriculture, forestry and land-use changes and wastes, based on the revised version of the International Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) methodologies of 1996. The outputs attained included:

(a) A greenhouse gas inventory based on 1994 emissions was established to form the basis for mitigation options. This was based on a 1985 study forecasting the 1995 situation;

(b) Some limitations were identified in the application of the IPCC methodologies and guidelines to the local conditions in Djibouti which is a very a very small country;

(c) Major data gaps were identified in all the sectors investigated;

(d) Suggestions were made for research to be conducted to improve future inventories.

10. Reduction options were identified and assessed for each of the sectors investigated, namely, energy, agriculture and forestry and wastes. Recommendations were also made for the reduction of emissions and for the enhanced performance of the existing sinks. These outputs generally matched the expected outputs and suggested that at the global level, Djibouti was more of a sink than a source of greenhouse gases.

11. Studies on vulnerability to climatic change were initiated during the period November 2000 - March 2001 on Djibouti's water resources, coastal area and terrestrial and marine ecosystems. Djibouti City was found to be one of the most vulnerable sites in the coastal area studies because a large part of the city is below sea level and is also the natural riverbed of River Ambouli, the largest seasonal river in the country.

12. A major output of this project is the production of important primary data that are necessary for a complete assessment of climate change vulnerability and impacts leading to policy options. For each of the sectors investigated, a range of potential adaptation options (stage I) were identified and assessed. However, further action is needed during phase II to integrate climate concerns into national planning.

13. During phase I of the project, a number of activities were initiated to form the basis for public awareness and education but there is still much to be done at various levels to achieve success because of inadequate funding and serious data gaps in almost all sectors.

14. At the initial stage, the project started by establishing the necessary institutional arrangements which would enable it to deliver technical outputs. The project management team was established with the assistance of the Office of the President, thus facilitating the mobilization and collaboration of key institutions or sectors such as agriculture and forestry, water resources, health, energy and meteorology involved in climate change-related activities. The project was instrumental in fostering collaboration between the various sectoral organizations and the Department of Environment.

15. A number of reports were produced as a result of the various investigations that took place during this phase of the project. The reports included: the national greenhouse gas inventory of Djibouti; mitigation options reports on forestry, transport, energy and wastes; study reports on vulnerability and adaptation to climate change in Djibouti; and the initial national communication. In the energy sector, there were recommendations for the reduction of dependence on fossil fuel through the development of geothermal sources and the use of other renewable sources of energy.

16. For land use, the reforestation programme and the use of energy-saving appliances such as cooking stoves are essential. The economic value of waste that can be recycled was also considered. The vulnerability of Djibouti City was very clearly identified, particularly considering that the sea level will rise and that two thirds of the city is below the sea level. The results revealed that Djibouti was a net sink country, considering the overall low level of emissions.

17. The implementing agency of the project was UNEP while the national executing agency was the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment within the Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development of Djibouti. The leadership provided by the Project Coordinator, who was deployed to the project on a full-time basis and who played the most active role in project development, was very crucial to the success of the project.

18. UNEP played an important technical support and advisory role. The Task Manager in the Division of Environmental Policy Development and Law (UNEP/DPDL) was able to provide advice, responded to queries and requests for technical support and served as a financial intermediary between the project and the Fund Management and Budget Section of UNEP.

19. Most of the participating institutions were public. The lack of active participation of the private sector was noted. Phase I of the project was research-oriented.

20. The training courses and workshops organized during the project development phase helped to upgrade the scientific and technical knowledge base of the consultants and of the other participants in the activities of the project. Four short group training courses were conducted through Environment and Development for the Third World (ENDA) and the University of Dakar. The project started by using the existing expertise that enabled the researchers to apply or to develop their skills to the new science of climate change. While in-depth research was not possible during this phase, it will be possible to undertake more targeted and independent studies in the future and one can say that the capacity-building process matched the national needs.

21. Djibouti has completed the initial national communication without the use of many expensive international consultants and the process seems to have been a very good learning experience for everyone involved. It was clear from the beginning that the teams needed additional technical training on the IPCC methodologies and guidelines. The assistance provided by the three consultants from ENDA and from the University of Dakar boosted the implementation process.

22. The project has effectively contributed to building on the existing expertise and enabled the researchers to develop their skills in the area of climate change. However, a great deal remains to be done to fully develop measures and strategic action plans to develop policies that can sustain sound socio-economic development. Intense and regular consultations should take place between all the major stakeholders to obtain the necessary endorsements and support and to define the major players and major development axes.

23. There was a serious gender imbalance in the implementation of the project since there was no female on the project management team apart from one female national consultant.

24. The project management team and the study teams did not observe the requirements rigorously. Project monitoring was therefore not as effective as expected. Some of the constraints encountered during the preparation of the initial national communication of Djibouti included inadequate documentation in French at the early stage, the timing of the first workshop on methodology, data issues and the timing of activities. In general, the whole implementation period was a learning process that should recommence as soon as possible.

25. The lessons that can be drawn from the implementation of this project include:

(a) The low understanding of the methodologies and guidelines proposed by IPCC for the calculation of the various greenhouse gas emissions, the various models, the scenarios and simulation posed a problem, particularly given the lack of materials in French at the initial stage. Receipt of these documents in French well in advance of the project start-up would have facilitated work during project implementation;

(b) The one-week training workshops were well received but they were somewhat too broad and too short to resolve the many issues and assist in the study and adaptation of the IPCC methodologies to the Djibouti context;

(c) Creation of synergy could be facilitated during phase II by the organization of regular briefing meetings between the coordinators of all these related and ongoing projects, which in most cases are under the umbrella of the Department of Environment;

(d) Policy and decision makers and planners are not yet fully sensitized to the pertinent results of the studies. This may be due to the fact that the studies have just been completed and, as a result, their outcome is still too scientific and somewhat abstract;

(e) The level of assistance received by the project teams from UNEP was rated “quite good” although it was the project management team that had requested the visit of the Task Manager;

(f) The implementation of the project has revealed a fairly unbalanced representation of the private sector in relation to the public sector, gender imbalance and the absence of civil society. The monitoring and evaluation systems developed to help in the supervision of the project were not fully followed.

26. The project achieved an overall rating of 3, that is "good", in this phase.

27. On the basis of the above observations, the following summary recommendations are made:

(a) During phase II, a number of in-depth studies should be conducted in the following priority areas: the coastal area, the vulnerability of Djibouti City and alternative sources of energy - renewable sources of energy such as geothermal, solar and wind;

(b) Subsequent studies should include more socio-economic factors and analyses, prepared as far as possible with the help of civil society. This should make the next communication a more valuable and assessable tool for policy makers to understand and to take policy development and planning into consideration;

(c) UNEP would do well to encourage the Government of Djibouti to reorganize the National Meteorology Department, which presently has only one station at the Djibouti Airport that is mainly involved in aeronautical meteorology;

(d) In order to ensure sustainability and more credibility in the future, the project should use the more relevant institutions or departments instead of relying solely on the consultants during phase II;

(e) Efforts should be made to promote the active involvement of all stakeholders from the public sector as well as a greater participation of civil society and the private sector;

(f) The Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment should launch a massive and aggressive public awareness campaign targeting policy makers, planners and the general public;

(g) Primary data collection should be organized in the various sectors investigated in order to constitute an accurate database that will be used in future inventories, assessments or update exercises. Training needs to be conducted in this area. Linkages should be developed with the Division of Early Warning and Assessment of (UNEP/DEWA);

(h) Financial and technical support should be given to Djibouti to consolidate the actual project results and to develop the portfolio of practical projects to be submitted for funding.

28. The project was successfully completed given Djibouti's size and available expertise. Existing data and data generated during the short project implementation period were used to complete the exercise. A great deal of work remains to be done to refine the data and to develop strategies and policies including capacity-building and coordination of action in order to increase awareness for effective and efficient action to ensure sustainable development of the country and to achieve the objectives of the Convention on Climate Change.

I. INTRODUCTION

29. The evaluation of the UNEP/GEF sub-project GF/ 2200-97-58 entitled "Enabling Activities for the Preparation of Initial National Communications Related to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) in Djibouti" was conducted under the guidance of the Officer-in-charge of the Evaluation and Oversight Unit of UNEP and in close collaboration with the UNEP Climate Change Enabling Activities (CCEA) Task Manager. This evaluation was undertaken during the period 1 September 2002 - 30 October 2002.

A. Background

30. This project was implemented from UNEP by the Climate Change Enabling Activities Task Manager in UNEP/DPDL and in Djibouti by the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment in the Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development. The project was planned for 24 months, starting from March 1999 to February 2001, but lasted until December 2001, that is a total of 34 months.

31. The Republic of Djibouti, a small country with a population of 632,000 inhabitants, covering 23,200 km2 in the Horn of Africa and situated at the junction of the Red Sea and the Gulf of Eden, with an arid climate and limited water resources, signed the Convention on Climate Change in 1992 at the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (Earth Summit) and ratified it in 1995. In order for Djibouti to begin to fulfill the obligations of the Convention, this project was funded by GEF to assist it in undertaking the following activities: to develop the National greenhouse gas inventory based on the 1994 base year; to identify and to assess mitigation options; to develop a comprehensive vulnerability assessment for various sectors; to identify stage I adaptation options; to build capacity to integrate climate change concerns into planning; and to provide public awareness and other information.

32. The main objective of the Convention on Climate Change is to stabilize concentrations of greenhouse gases in the atmosphere at a level that would prevent dangerous anthropogenic interference with the global climate system. Through the Convention, which entered into force in March 1994, Governments formally recognized that human-induced climate change was an important environmental threat and that there was a need for action. The Convention commits Parties to certain reporting obligations and in order to promote their preparation and submission, the first Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Climate Change requested that GEF operate as an interim financial mechanism of the Convention and give priority to providing financial support for the preparation of the required national communications from non-Annex I Parties.

33. UNEP, as one of the implementing agencies of GEF, is contributing to strategic, scientific and technical support to the Convention on Climate Change through an umbrella project. As it seeks to improve the scientific and technical information to enhance the implementation of the Convention on Climate Change, UNEP is committed to the following:

(a) Enabling selected developing countries Parties to meet their reporting obligations under article 12.1 of the Convention on Climate Change;

(b) Strengthening the technical capacity of national institutions to develop the studies required for national communications;

(c) Providing guidance to GEF for the timely provision of the financial support needed by the Parties to meet their obligations;

(d) Facilitating the process of preparation, compilation and consideration of the communications;

(e) Ensuring that the Conference of the Parties has sufficient information to carry out its responsibilities to assess the overall effects of the steps taken by the Parties and to assess the implementation of the Convention.

B. Purpose and scope of the evaluation

34. The main objective of the evaluation was to assess the project outputs and results in terms of relevance, appropriateness, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability. The purpose of the evaluation was to determine the extent to which the project had been successful in achieving its objectives and obtaining the expected results in a cost-effective manner.

35. The evaluation covers the activities UNEP conducted to implement the preparation of the initial national communication. As per the terms of reference attached to the present report as annex I, the report compares the planned outputs of the project with the actual outputs and assesses the steps taken to sustain the capacity built. The report also highlights the lessons learned and suggests recommendations that may help to improve the implementation of pending activities and future projects in the area of climate change. The evaluation also assesses the appropriateness of this project in meeting the long-term objectives of UNEP, GEF and the Convention.

C. Methodology of the evaluation

36. The consultant reviewed documentation (listed in annex II) provided by the project management team and which included the initial national communication and various progress reports. In addition, a CD-ROM containing the initial national communication and a report of studies on each component of the initial national communication was made available by UNEP and the Project Coordinator in Djibouti.

37. The consultant travelled to Djibouti to meet and to discuss with several contributors to the project and to the final document, namely, the national executing agency, the project management team, government officials and other stakeholders not involved in the project such as the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Resident Representative and researchers of the Intergovernmental Authority for Development (IGAD). A field visit was organized to a Somali refugee camp to see some ongoing activities. A list of the persons met is attached to the present report as annex III and the schedule of visits as annex IV.

38. During the evaluation, the consultant benefited from the advice and guidance of the Task Manager at UNEP, the Acting Chief, Evaluation and Oversight Unit and the GEF Project Fund Manager with whom he had regular discussions. This approach helped the consultant to evaluate various aspects of project implementation, management, policy integration and technical issues in order to meet the requirements of the terms of reference of the evaluation.

II. FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

A. Assistance provided by the project to Djibouti for the implementation of the subproject

39. Djibouti realized early enough that the preparation of the initial national communication was an important step towards fulfilling the requirements of UNFCCC and contributing to the global effort of reduction of greenhouse gas emissions. Following the ratification of the Convention by the Government of Djibouti on 27 August 1995 and the coming into force of the Convention, the project was designed to assist this country with fragile ecosystems prone to drought and desertification and generally highly vulnerable to the adverse effects of climate change. The project was to make available to the appropriate national implementing agency the amount of $310,000 requested over two years to enable Djibouti to fulfill its reporting requirements under the Convention. After a smooth project preparation period, the project document was signed by the Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development on 14 March 1999 for implementation. Arrangements were made for direct disbursements of funds to the national implementing agency in Djibouti through the Banque du Commerce et de l'Industrie de Djibouti. The Project Coordinator and the Director of Environment are co-signatories. As a direct consequence, the project management team had easy access to the funds allocated to the project during the implementation of this phase. In addition, technical assistance was provided to the country upon request. The Task Manager at UNEP was at the disposal of the project management team for backstopping. However, the project management team and the national implementing agency were given full control over the implementation of the project.

40. Some of the activities depended directly or indirectly on the timely assistance of the Task Manager such as the provision of the documentation necessary for the activities, for example, the IPCC/UNEP recommendations, methodologies and guidelines for the various studies and the National greenhouse gas inventory and the involvement of the international consultants recruited to assist in training and policy analysis, development and the organization of workshops.

B. Appropriateness of the project to the objectives of the Convention, the United Nations Environment Programme and the Global Environment Facility

41. According to article 2 of the Convention, the ultimate objective of the convention is the stabilization of the concentration of greenhouse gases in the atmosphere at the level that "would prevent continued dangerous anthropogenic interference with the climate system." The focus areas of GEF, biological diversity, international waters, climate change and protection of the ozone layer constitute some of the subprogramme elements of UNEP. UNEP is also one of the main bodies of IPCC. The UNEP/GEF Enabling Activities project, which is housed within UNEP/DPDL, deals with issues pertaining to the

preparation of the national communications to the Convention on Climate Change and fits well into the UNEP subprogramme element on climate change. The project outputs will be incorporated into the deliberations of IPCC on impacts, adaptation and vulnerability.

42. The activities conducted by Djibouti within the framework of the project included the development of the National greenhouse gas inventory and the assessment of the vulnerability of some sectors. The activities helped Djibouti to begin to identify and to evaluate mitigation and adaptation measures that could form the basis of future strategies and action plans. The activities generated data for the various sectors studied and, most importantly, helped to identify major data gaps.

43. The project facilitated the organization of technical training (workshop) to inform and to train the national consultants recruited and national experts on the use of the analytical tools and methodologies developed and described in the IPCC/UNEP handbooks on methods or climate change impacts assessment and adaptation strategies. These methodologies were particularly used in the greenhouse gas inventories. This was consistent with the mandate of UNEP for the provision of technical assistance and scientific information on which the countries, particularly non-Annex I Parties to the Convention, could base their decision–making regarding areas requiring urgent environmental intervention as in the case of Djibouti. The scientific and technical expertise gained by nationals will help them to give policy makers relevant advice. The project in Djibouti was appropriate and consistent with the programme and the mandate of UNEP and to a large extent contributed to the objectives of the Convention and of GEF.

C. Comparison between planned results and actual results

44. The project undertook the nine activities described below.

Activity 1: Establishment of the project management team and the national study teams

45. This activity was carried out as planned and was facilitated by a presidential decree appointing the National Climate Change Committee (NCCC) which is also chaired by the Department of Environment. The project management team and the national study teams were established during the period May-September 1999. They undertook the various studies, a list of which is attached as annex VI of the present report. The terms of reference of each body and its composition were clearly stated. The technical secretariat of NCCC was the Climate Change Unit under the Director of Environment in collaboration with the National Meteorology Department. The Chair of the Climate Change Committee also has the capacity to include into the project any relevant institution or expert if need be. A project manager was identified and appointed by the Director of Environment.

46. Seven national consultants were initially identified from various government departments, national research institutions and the private sector to form the various study teams and their terms of reference were drafted. The Director of Environment, the Project Coordinator and the heads of the study teams formed the project management team, chaired by the Director of Environment. A total of thirteen consultants, ten national and three international, were involved in the implementation of the project.

Activity 2: The National greenhouse gas inventory

47. The most important activity during this phase was carried out by eight consultants who investigated greenhouse gas emissions from some processes and sources in three sectors, namely: energy, industries, transport; agriculture, forestry and land-use changes; and wastes on the basis of the revised version of the IPCC methodologies of 1996.

48. The following outputs were attained in this activity:

(a) A greenhouse gas inventory based on 1994 emissions was drawn up to form the basis for mitigation options. This was based on a 1985 study forecasting the 1995 situation;

(b) Some limitations were identified in the application of the IPCC methodologies and guidelines to the local conditions in Djibouti;

(c) Major data gaps were identified in all the sectors investigated;

(d) Suggestions were made for research to be conducted to improve future inventories however, no monitoring system was proposed for regular update;

(e) The inventory study group underwent a training course on methodologies conducted by the international consultants from ENDA based in Senegal after conducting preliminary investigations.

49. These outputs generally matched the expected outputs and suggested that at the global level, Djibouti was more of a sink than a source of greenhouse gas emissions. At the end of this activity, a validation workshop was organized to harmonize the findings.

Activity 3: Identification of mitigation options and enhancement of sinks

50. The following outputs were attained in this activity:

(a) Reduction options were identified and assessed for each of the sectors investigated, namely, energy, agriculture, forestry and wastes;

(b) Recommendations were made for the reduction of emissions and for the enhanced performance of the existing sinks;

(c) National mitigation strategies were proposed;

(d) Options were assessed, analysed, described and some programmes and projects were identified in relation to the environment and the economic gains that Djibouti might derive from them;

(e) The cost of energy is too high given the economic capacity of the country. Consequently, the use of geothermal, solar and other renewable energy sources were proposed in the energy sector while in forestry, reforestation of various parts of the country such as mountains and plains was recommended;

(f) Multi-purpose use of wastes generated by human activities was proposed. Their use for the production of energy for various processes such as cement production, production of mineral water, fertilizers and manure. It was established that there was a need for major capacity-building and public awareness campaigns. This was emphasized during the training workshop organized to validate this activity and also served to introduce issues related to vulnerability to climate change.

Activity 4: Policy options for monitoring systems and response strategies for climatic change impacts

51. Studies on vulnerability to climatic changes were initiated during the period November 2000 - March 2001 on Djibouti's water resources, coastal area and terrestrial and marine ecosystems. The study teams involved assessed the potential impacts of climate change in these four sectors. An attempt was made to use scenarios such as the general circulation models for future regional climate change. Prediction of future climate in Djibouti was made and the vulnerability of the various sectors and their specific resources was assessed. Djibouti City was found to be one of the most vulnerable sites in the coastal area studies because a large part of the city is below sea level and is also the natural riverbed of River Ambouli, the largest seasonal river in the country.

52. A major output of this activity was the production of important primary data necessary for a comprehensive climate change vulnerability and impacts assessment that would lead to policy options. Biodiversity conservation and restoration activities figured prominently in the response strategy for adaptation to climate change.

53. All the national consultants associated with this project were trained during a workshop on vulnerability studies and the use of models and scenarios conducted by an international consultant from the University of Dakar.

Activity 5: Policy framework for implementing adaptation measures and response strategies

54. For each of the sectors investigated, a range of potential adaptation options (stage I) were identified and assessed. Some programme or project concepts were proposed, leading to the drafting of national strategies to reduce the impacts of climate change in the various sectors. For example, in the energy sector, the following mitigation options were proposed: reduction of the use of air conditioners through the improvement and redesign of the housing sector; the improvement of power stations in order to make them more efficient and economical in electricity supply; and the use of renewable energy sources, for example, wind and solar and geothermal energy. With regard to the management of wastes generated in Djibouti, multi-purpose use of the products was proposed while use of multi-purpose species in the reforestation programme was suggested with regard to forestry. It should be noted that most of these proposals appear in the Djibouti National Socio-Economic Development Plan 2001-2010. A validation workshop was organized to finalize this activity.

Activity 6: Capacity-building to integrate climate concerns into planning

55. During the various workshops and training sessions, the relevant institutions and government departments were invited to join the consultants, representatives of institutions and members of the project management team participating in the deliberations. Stakeholders from the private sector were also invited. The vulnerability studies and impacts assessment revealed the high vulnerability of certain sites in Djibouti City where new urban and port infrastructures are being developed. However, the outputs from this activity were not far-reaching and further action is needed during phase II.

Activity 7: Programmes related to sustainable development research and public awareness

56. During this phase of the project, a number of activities were initiated to form the basis for public awareness and education. There were press releases, radio and television programmes and newspaper articles during the workshops. There have also been some linkages with other programmes contributing to sustainable development such as the National Programme to Combat Desertification, the National Biological Diversity Programme and the National Action Plan for the Environment whose activities are slowly being complemented by the Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development and the Ministry of Agriculture. The Ministry of Education has started incorporating climate change issues and concerns into the curricula of schools and teacher training colleges and producing radio and television educational programmes in the various languages. The implementation of these changes is slow because of inadequate funding. Given that the aim of the project activities is to create environmental awareness, a great deal remains to be done at various levels to achieve success. For example, it is necessary to extend these educational programmes to parents and to the general public.

Activity 8: Provision of additional information

57. During this phase, it was difficult to provide additional information on all the planned project activities due to serious data gaps in all the sectors investigated. Nevertheless, relevant information from the National Socio-economic Development Plan was used for the project. The energy sector was reluctant to provide data at the beginning of the project. In fact, the operators of the sector involved in transportation were very unwilling to share information relating to the volume of fuel consumed every year, particularly during the reference year.

Activity 9: Preparation of the initial national communication

58. The project teams prepared and completed the initial national communication. A presidential decree was issued on 18 May 2002 to approve it after which it was submitted to UNEP and the Convention secretariat.

D. Assessment of the quality and usefulness of the project outputs

59. The project started by establishing the necessary institutional arrangements which would enable it to deliver technical outputs and to provide a framework for the initial national communication to the Convention secretariat.

1. Institutional arrangements

60. The project management team was established with the assistance of the Office of the President, thus facilitating the mobilization and collaboration of key institutions and sectors such as agriculture and forestry, water resources, health, energy and meteorology involved in climate change-related activities. The project was instrumental in promoting collaboration between the various sectoral organizations and the Department of Environment which was previously operating under the Office of the President. The Department of Environment has now been given a high profile within the Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development to enable it to continue dealing with crucial issues affecting the development of the country. The level of commitment demonstrated by the various actors and institutions to the project was quite variable depending on their level of responsibility and the timing of the project.

2. Capacity-building

61. Most of the national consultants were young professionals holding a bachelor's or master's degree from universities in France or other developed countries. A few were holders of doctorates. Their commitment to the project made them start activities before participating in the first training course on the National greenhouse gas inventory. The training courses and workshops organized during the project development phase helped to upgrade the scientific and technical knowledge base of the consultants and of the other people participating in the activities of the project.

62. Despite the need for additional training for most of the consultants and the need to recruit more consultants for future studies, the project enabled the various participating stakeholders to learn more about the importance of climate change. The project revealed the shortcomings of the documentation prepared by IPCC, which in the Djibouti context provided too many details that were not useful at that stage.

63. The National Educational Curriculum Development Centre started a number of activities incorporating climate change concerns as a result of the active participation of the then Assistant Director in the project as a consultant. He has since been promoted to the position of Director of the National Curriculum Development Centre.

3. Technical outputs

64. A number of reports were produced as a result of the various investigations that took place during this phase of the project. The reports included: the National greenhouse gas inventory; reports on mitigation options on forestry, transport, energy and wastes; reports on studies on vulnerability and adaptation to climate change in Djibouti; and the initial national communication. Other products include students' and teachers' educational training materials and various newspaper articles. Most of the reports and documents produced were the first of their kind and as consolidated environmental information, they proved very useful with regard to national development plans. They provided, for the first time, justification for some positive action to be taken in several sectors and they will be useful in terms of directing policy action. They also reflected the preliminary nature of the results obtained because of the data gaps and the problems encountered during the preparation of the various studies.

65. With regard to the energy sector, there were recommendations for the reduction of dependence on fossil fuel through the development of geothermal sources and the use of other renewable sources of energy. With regard to land use, the reforestation programme and the use of energy-saving appliances such as cooking stoves are essential. The economic value of products made from recycled waste was also considered. The vulnerability of the coastal area, namely Djibouti City, was clearly identified, particularly considering that the sea level will rise and that two thirds of the city is below sea level. The project also initiated public awareness-creation activities.

66. The results pointed out the major sources and sinks of greenhouse house emissions in Djibouti and observed that Djibouti was a net sink country given the overall low level of emissions. They are very useful for future development and for the strategies to be put in place.

67. Most of the documents were revised by ENDA and subjected to validation workshops before being incorporated into the initial national communication. The project contributed in many ways to the achievement of results and to meeting the overall objectives of the Convention.

68. The use of qualitative parameters or approximations because of lack of data for in-depth assessment and analysis necessitates carrying out of further studies during phase II. However, the overall quality and usefulness of these technical outputs were good.

E. Impact of the results of activity 1 on the preparation of the initial national communication

69. The first activity of the project involved the establishment of the project management team and the national study teams responsible for writing the initial national communication. Considering that Djibouti is a small country, this process was crucial for the smooth implementation of the rest of the activities.

70. The national executing agency of the project is the Directorate General of Environment and Regional Development within the Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development. The process was then partially facilitated by the Office of the President, which established the National Climate Change Committee. The Director of Environment was appointed Chair of the National Climate Change Committee and also Chair of the project management team. The Director in turn appointed a young officer of the department as the Project Coordinator. In principle, nine institutions and one environmental non-governmental organization, made up the National Climate Change Committee.

71. The national study teams were made up of two groups of five consultants each. One of the responsibilities of the National Climate Change Committee was to oversee the activities of the Project Management Team. That activity went on well and enabled the project to start smoothly despite the delays in other activities and some technical drawbacks.

F. Effectiveness of the organizational structure and the management and financial systems

72. The implementing agency for the project was UNEP while the national executing agency was the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment in the Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environmental and Regional Development. Both played an active role in drawing up the country's proposal for enabling activities. The Department of Environment provided space for the Project Coordinator and the secretariat. The supervision of the project was entrusted to the National Climate Change Committee which comprises government departments involved at the technical level. Some of the staff of the government departments were involved directly as consultants in the teams.

73. The project management team and the study teams operated under the umbrella of the Department of Environment. The leadership provided by the Project Coordinator, who was deployed to the project on a full-time basis and who played the most active role in project implementation, was very crucial to the success of the project. He was supervised and assisted by the Chair and the Deputy Chair of the project management team.

74. UNEP played an important technical support and advisory role. The Task Manager in UNEP/DPDL was able to provide advice, responded to queries and requests for technical support and served as a financial intermediary between the project and the Fund Management and Budget Section of UNEP. Together with the Budget and Financial Management Service of UNEP, the Fund Manager and the Task Manager were able to make financial arrangements, in collaboration with the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment of Djibouti, for funds to be transferred directly to the project account. Cash advances were transferred expeditiously and did not contribute to the delays that occurred during project implementation.

75. The Director of Environment and his deputy played a supervisory role. The Project Coordinator was fully responsible for the technical aspects of the project and for all financial matters. The national team played a key role in project implementation. The local consultants conducted all the studies, drew up the inventories and wrote the reports and the Initial National Communication. The assistance provided by the three consultants from ENDA and from the University of Dakar boosted the implementation process. They were instrumental in the training and building of the capacities of the project team and the national consultants and in the revision of the various reports used for the Initial National Communication. This institutional arrangement did not contribute to the delays that occurred during the implementation of the project.

G. Involvement of the stakeholders

76. The issue of climate change affects several sectors (both public and private) of the national economy. It involves almost all government departments. Most of the stakeholders, however, were technocrats, research scientists or academics. Djibouti being a small country, most of the participating institutions were government institutions or parastatal institutions based in Djibouti City. The lack of active participation of the private sector was noted. Only Djibouti Electricity participated in the greenhouse gas inventory and vulnerability studies. The poor participation of many government institutions was also apparent. The National Climate Change Committee was established but did not hold any specific meeting on the project. Some of its member institutions were, however, represented at the various project workshops or were members of the study teams.

77. The same institutions or representatives attended the events organized by the project. Representatives of the various ministries and institutions, like in most developing small countries, were more inclined to work as national consultants. As a result, an informal network of these technocrats and consultants was established and is growing stronger and can facilitate the exchange of information and data.

78. Phase I of the project was research-oriented. Consequently, very few policy makers and grassroots representatives were involved. Non-governmental organizations, which are few in Djibouti, were absent. Most of them are just beginning to be organized and recognized, particularly those involved in environmental matters. Regional organizations such as IGAD and the military cooperation officials (French, German and American) were not involved in the observation and monitoring of the impact of climatic change.

H. Capacity-building

79. The requirement to enhance capacity, which is an integral part of the obligations of the Parties to the Convention, includes, inter alia, strengthening of institutions, human resources development, increased ability to raise awareness and access to information.

80. With regard to institutional strengthening, the main mechanism is the establishment of a multidisciplinary and multisectoral country team. Emphasis was put on the need to draw from the available expertise in the country both in the public and private sectors. With regard to training and education, the project included a provision in the budget for enhancing the capacity of the national experts in various climate change issues through training. Four short group training courses were conducted through ENDA and the University of Dakar. The workshops organized for the national consultants were also attended by other participants representing the institutions of the National Climate Change Committee. Some policy makers were also invited to attend the validation workshops. The project started using effectively the existing expertise that enabled the researchers to apply or to develop their skills in the new science of climate change.

81. The project has involved relevant staff of the Ministry of Education, for example the Director of the National Curriculum Development Centre who, as a national consultant, has been instrumental in the inclusion of climate change in the curricula of schools and teacher training colleges. Television programmes and other teaching materials for other audiences have also been prepared.

82. The preparation of inventories and assessments has revealed the existence of serious information and data gaps in various sectors related to climatic change and impacts assessment, particularly in the collection of meteorological data.

83. Although in-depth research was not possible during this phase of the project, more targeted and independent studies could be undertaken in the future. In fact, there is often a trade-off between building of national capacity and the completion of technical research in a short period of time, particularly in a situation where awareness of climatic change issues and availability of expertise in related technical areas are limited. This has been the case of Djibouti. However, the final products of the technical teams provide sufficient evidence of a fairly adequate basic expertise in the various climatic change areas and one can say that the capacity-building process matched the national needs.

84. The Project Coordinator and a member of the study teams attended a workshop on the preparation of initial national communications in Cameroon.

85. Djibouti completed the initial national communication without the use of many expensive international consultants and even if the technical investigations were somewhat compromised, the process seems to have been a very good learning experience for everyone involved.

I. Qualifications of the consultants used for the project

86. At the national level, a multidisciplinary team of national experts, mostly from government departments and selected on the basis of their existing scientific and technical expertise, was involved in the implementation of the project under the umbrella of the Department of Environment.

87. Emphasis was put on national expertise and the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment recruited ten national consultants to constitute the national study teams. The list of the national consultants is attached to annex V of the present report. Only one consultant was from the private sector and none came from non-governmental organizations. Most of the national consultants, with the exception of two holders of doctorates, were holders of master's degrees from universities in France and other developed countries. The core group was quite knowledgeable, committed and keen to see the project implemented smoothly and on time.

88. It was clear from the beginning that the teams needed additional technical training on the IPCC methodologies and guidelines. External expertise was provided by ENDA for the preparation of inventories and mitigation options and the revision of the technical reports prepared by the national consultants and the international consultant from the University of Dakar for vulnerability, impacts assessments and adaptation studies. They were fully committed and professional in the training of the consultants and in the review of the various study documents.

89. The project contributed effectively to building on the existing expertise and enabled the researchers to develop their skills in the area of climate change. The use of a good number of national consultants (ten) and only three international consultants proved quite cost-effective, particularly if the long-term gain for Djibouti is considered. The relationship between the consultants was also quite smooth. This resulted in the completion of this phase of the project without any serious problem.

J. Integration of the result into national policy-making and planning

90. The various investigations, from the greenhouse gas inventory to the identification of possible adaptations and strategies for mitigation of the impact of climate change in Djibouti, are preliminary. They are the first ones of their kind in the country. More remains to be done to refine them and to analyze the results and to develop measures and strategic action plans fully to arrive at policies that can sustain sound socio-economic development.

91. Although it is too early to determine to what extent the results are currently being integrated into national planning, there are a number of actions and decisions taken that suggest that the project has responded to the following identified concerns and needs of Djibouti:

(a) The Government has integrated the Initial National Communication submitted to the Convention into its legislation;

(b) Curricula for schools and teacher training colleges prepared by the National Curriculum Development Centre are being modified to incorporate climate change issues, taking into consideration results obtained during the investigations;

(c) Educational television programmes in local languages are being prepared by the National Curriculum Development Centre.

92. For the results to be integrated into national planning more expeditiously, policy makers and high-ranking government officials need to be well sensitized. One of the objectives of the project was to strengthen the national capacity to integrate climate concerns into development planning through the education and training of policy and decision makers. Consequently, some policy makers and high-ranking government officials were invited to the various workshops organized within the framework of the project. However, since the initial national communication was completed only recently, the national planners will not appropriate its findings immediately. The Department of Environment is the Chair of the National Climate Change Committee and is also involved in the National Environment Action Plan and many environment conventions. This provides the needed mechanisms for the results of the initial national communication to be integrated into the National Action Plan for Sustainable Development in the foreseeable future. Linkages with UNDP, which provides some coordination and integration of various national development programmes, could also speed up the process and assist in the search for external funds. The National Centre for Scientific Research for Development, Djibouti's leading scientific research centre involved in the initial national communication, has already proposed that intense and regular consultations should take place between all the major stakeholders to obtain the necessary endorsements and support and to define the major players and major development axes.

K. United Nations Environment Programme assistance to Djibouti to meet her commitments

93. UNEP assisted Djibouti in formulating the project for funding by GEF and provided a task manager based at UNEP headquarters to provide guidance and technical assistance. Various tools were provided such as documentation, guidelines and advice, to help the project team carry out the various activities. Regular fund disbursements by the Fund Manager through the Budget and Financial Management Service of UNEP were made. The Task Manager also ensured that the required software and equipment were purchased on time to facilitate the work of the Project Manager. Regular reporting was required from the Project Coordinator in order to monitor the implementation of the project and provide necessary guidance to the team to maintain it on course.

94. The Task Manager facilitated the involvement of ENDA to provide expert training on the greenhouse gas inventory and the mitigation options as well as the revision of the remaining sectoral reports. Similarly, the involvement of the consultant from the University of Dakar was arranged through UNEP. The Task Manager is welcome to visit Djibouti during the next phase. In addition, the project management team has indicated that it would appreciate the increased involvement of the other UNEP divisions as well as the Regional Office for Africa (ROA), the United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR) and the Convention secretariat.

L. Gender considerations in the implementation of the project

95. There was a serious gender imbalance in the implementation of the project since there was no female in the project management team. Only one of the national consultants was female in addition to the international consultant from the University of Dakar who was involved in the vulnerability and adaptation studies. In general, women were considerably under-represented in the implementation of the project. In principle, this was not a problem in view of the fact that the selection of the team members was based on qualifications rather than on gender and that there are hardly any female researchers in Djibouti. The reasons for this gender imbalance could be, inter alia, the small population and the culture of the Djibouti society which excludes women from certain professions. However, options to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and response measures relating to vulnerability assessment involve women. For example, a response measure would require a shift from traditional consumption of fuelwood as a source of energy to

new improved energy-saving stoves or to new emission-free technology all together. For this reason, the role of women in collecting wood for household cooking and use as domestic energy and in designing energy-saving cooking systems such as improved stoves needs to be taken into consideration during the next phase.

M. Effectiveness of the monitoring and evaluation systems developed by the project

96. According to the project document, the study teams would provide monthly progress reports to the project management team, the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment and UNEP. Reports were provided but not as regularly as required. Quarterly financial reports were also to be provided by the Project Coordinator. These were also not submitted on time and UNEP had to send reminders. Due to the limited number of experts available in the country, the national consultants were full-time government employees who had to perform their normal duties. For this reason, the project's deadlines were not always met. The study teams and the project management team did not observe the requirements rigorously. Consequently, monitoring was not as effective as expected.

N. Potential contribution of the project to furthering of the objectives of environmental assessment

97. The main objective of the project was to enable the country to fulfill its commitments and obligations as required by articles 4.1 and 12.1 of the Convention on Climate Change, particularly the preparation and submission of its Initial National Communication as required by article 12.1 (a), (b) and (c) of the Convention based on the guidelines and format recommended by the Second Conference of the Parties for non-Annex 1 Parties. Through the process, it was expected that the country would be able to build its scientific and technical capacity so that it could sustain all activities related to the Initial National Communication and the implementation of the Convention on Climate Change. Most of the activities and outputs of the project were designed to contribute towards the achievement of this objective hence this question is implicitly discussed throughout the evaluation.

O. Constraints to project implementation

1. Documentation

98. Most of the literature received in the early stages by the project management team and the project participants, for example the IPCC methodologies and UNEP guidelines, were in English. Literature was available in French only later. During the project, arrangements were made for translation into French of the 1996 version of the methodologies sent to Djibouti. The methodologies helped the consultants considerably.

2. The timing of the first workshop on methodology

99. The consultants responsible for the preparation of the National greenhouse gas inventory started the investigations without receiving any form of training on the methodology. Due to some inconsistencies in the planning at the national level, the ENDA consultants provided training three months after the team had been conducting its investigations. This made it more difficult for them to initiate this activity and limited their ability to obtain good results from the beginning.

3. Data issues

100. Availability of much-needed data in the various sectors often posed a problem. They were either nonexistent or had serious gaps, for example, meteorological data were missing because meteorological services were interrupted for several years after independence and data had not been collected during that period. In addition to the lack of data, access to information was also a major problem. In the energy sector, for example, private oil companies were reluctant to provide data. Data were also scanty, particularly in the National Meteorology Department which functions only at the airport and is therefore more oriented towards aeronautical weather forecasting.

101. The quality of the data provided was very poor because of the method of collection. It was outdated most of the time. Reliance on the average level set by the IPCC guidelines was often an alternative to qualitative assessment of situations. In the preparation of inventories, there was a glaring lack of data on the agricultural sector, particularly on animal husbandry. There were no data for the year under review and it therefore became necessary to extrapolate from the values of the following year.

4. Timing of activities

102. Activities are almost completely paralyzed in summer. However, activities picked up slowly immediately after the project was launched just before summer. They resumed later towards the end of the year. That partly explained why the project implementation period was extended.

5. Time constraints

103. Towards the end of the project period, there was inadequate time to finalize the studies, particularly on vulnerability and impact assessment. There was little time for the drafting of reports and the completion of the initial national communications in order to meet the deadlines.

6. Review of sectoral reports

104. Delays were also experienced during the ENDA review of sectoral reports prepared by the national consultants. That responsibility was initially not included in the terms of reference of ENDA; it was added later.

III. LESSONS LEARNED

105 The Project Coordinator and the various consultants that the evaluator met agreed that the whole implementation period had been a useful learning process. The following lessons, which could have an impact on future activities, can be drawn from the implementation of the project:

(a) The methodologies and guidelines proposed by IPCC for the calculation of the various greenhouse gas emissions, the various models, the scenarios and simulations were not well understood by the consultants. This was aggravated by the inadequacy of material in French at the initial stage. To avoid this kind of situation, it is imperative to hold training sessions early and to make the literature available in the appropriate language;

(b) The one-week training workshops were well received but they were somewhat too broad and too short to resolve the many issues and assist in the study and adaptation of the IPCC methodologies to the Djibouti context. Several of the IPCC models were not useful to the consultants and could not be applied to the local conditions. In future, a more focused and longer training course (two weeks) on specific issues, for example, greenhouse gas inventory methodologies only or scenarios and models only would be very beneficial to all national consultants (old and new);

(c) At the time of the implementation of the project, a number of climate change-related projects and studies were ongoing in Djibouti. Some, such as the preparation of the National Environmental Action Plan, have ended while others such as the Regional Organization for the Conservation of the Environment of the Red Sea and the Gulf of Aden (PERSGA) are still continuing. Information, documentation and data from some of these studies were useful to the study teams. Although the coordinator of PERSGA was also a member of one of the national study teams, more synergy could be created between some of these projects and the Enabling Activities Project. Creation of synergy could be facilitated during phase II through the organization of regular briefing meetings between the coordinators of all these ongoing projects, which in most cases are under the umbrella of the Department of Environment;

(d) The national workshops were in principle opened to a larger audience than to the study teams. There were participants from the National Climate Change Committee and ministries other than the Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development. Some policy and decision makers also attended;

(e) The media were often present and this was an opportunity for interaction between scientists, policy makers and the media, leading to public awareness-creation on issues related to climate change and development in Djibouti. Somehow, the interaction failed to sensitize the policy and decision makers and planners on the pertinent results of the studies. As stated earlier, this was probably because the studies have just been completed and as a result, their outcome is still too scientific and somewhat abstract. In addition, a comprehensive public awareness campaign on the issues concerned has not yet been launched to convince everyone. Another reason could be that the various consultants did not represent the institutions they were working for (putting less weight on the findings of the studies);

(f) The level of assistance received by the project teams from UNEP was rated quite good. The delegation of full control of project implementation to the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment was also well appreciated by the country. However all project staff should receive their full remuneration as provided for in the budget because this would ensure total commitment to the project and the use of authority to ensure that all activities and the timely delivery of the various products are on track;

(g) The implementation of the project has revealed a fairly unbalanced representation of the private sector in relation to the public sector, gender imbalance and the absence of civil society. In view of the importance of these investigations for the development of the country, their implementation should be inclusive rather than exclusive in order to make use of all the relevant and competent expertise in the country from the private sector and civil society in the future;

(h) The monitoring and evaluation systems developed for the supervision of the project were not fully adhered to. The progress and financial reports were not submitted on time. A major delay at the beginning of the project led to an extension of the project implementation period to 1 December. With the exception of the consultant in the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment, the consultants were recruited as individuals but retained their full duties in their respective institutions. This contributed a great deal to the delays in the completion of investigations and reports by the various study teams. The choice of consultants, their availability and commitments as well as institution should be considered carefully in future phases.

IV. RATING OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROJECT

106. The implementation of the project is rated as follows:

A. Timeliness

107. The project was to be implemented from March 99 to February 2001. However, following the review of the project document in September 2000 and February 2001, it was extended to December 2001. The implementation of the project was delayed mainly due to the late completion of the investigations and reporting by the consultants. Only 84.07 per cent of the budget was spent. Timeliness is rated good (60-74 per cent).

B. Achievement of the results and objectives

1. Attainment of outputs

108. During this phase, the major outputs set for individual activities were attained, with the exception of activity 6. The objectives reviewed were attained and the results were achieved at 80 per cent. The initial national communication of Djibouti was prepared and the process the country went through and its commitment to subsequent phases have been summarized. The rating is 2 - very good (75-89 per cent).

2. Completion of activities

109. Activity 6 was not completed but almost 75 per cent of all the other activities were completed. A rating of 3 - good (60-74 per cent) was given in view of the local conditions of Djibouti.

3. Project execution within the allocated budget

110. An account was opened and UNEP/GEF transferred the project funds directly into the account which is co-signed by the Project Coordinator and the Director of Environment. The Project Coordinator does not receive the entire salary budgeted for this position. This is apparently shared with the other directors (Director/Deputy Director, Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment) who also supervise the implementation of the project.

111. The vehicle provided was used for other projects of the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment when the need arose. There was no major incident except the delay in the submission of the financial report. The implementation of the project did not exhaust the budgeted funds. The remaining funds could be used for the completion of activities 5 and 6. The rating is 2 - very good.

4. Impact created by the project

112. This phase constituted a real learning process for all those involved who at the same time gained a great deal of knowledge in the area of climate change. The preparation of the National greenhouse gas inventory was started and the vulnerability of the various sectors was assessed. 75 per cent of the expected impact was achieved. The curricula of schools and teacher training colleges are being adapted to incorporate climate change concerns. The rating is 2 - very good.

5. Sustainability

113. The institutions in place have begun functioning. Training has taken place and there are now some trained officers to continue the activities. The establishment of databases is at the initial stage. Policies have not yet been incorporated into the planning and implementation stages. The rating is 3 - very good.

6. Successful resolution of major problems faced by the project

114. Attempts have been made to find lasting solutions to all problems faced by the project. Initial steps were taken for the ones that needed long-term solutions such as the Climate Change Documentation Library. The rating is 3.

C. Overall rating of the project

115. The project achieved an overall rating of 3 (good) in this phase. This is an acceptable performance, taking into account the difficult general situation of Djibouti and the gains that can be achieved through the implementation of phase II as soon as possible.

	1	**2**	**3**	**4**	**5**
Timeliness			*		
Attainment of outputs		*			
Completion of activities			*		
Project executed within the budget		*			
Impact created by the project		*			
Sustainability			*		
Solution of major problems encountered			*		
Overall			*		

V. RECOMMENDATIONS

116. The following recommendations are a result of the valuable discussions held with all parties involved in the project as well as the documents availed for the evaluation.

A. Priority studies during phase II

117. Given that these studies were the first leading to the initial national communication, they constituted a learning process for all involved. They revealed the important gaps in basic information in the various sectors. On the basis of these observations, the following recommendations are made:

(a) That during phase II, a number of in-depth studies be conducted in the following priority areas: the coastal area; the vulnerability of Djibouti City; and alternative sources of energy (renewable sources of energy such as geothermal, solar and wind). It is further recommended that these and subsequent studies include more socio-economic factors and analysis, prepared as much as possible with the help of civil society. This should make the next communication a more valuable and assessable tool for policy makers to understand and to take into consideration policy development and planning;

(b) That a portfolio of project proposals based on these studies and with a well calculated investment cost be prepared and that they aim at reducing greenhouse gas emissions, contributing to poverty eradication and reducing the dependence of Djibouti on fossil fuel.

B. Strengthening of the acquired capacity

118. There is a need to continue building on the capacity already built. Djibouti still lacks specialists in many areas. To ensure sustainability, it is necessary that phase II be based on the capacity built to date. Some of the consultants have already been deployed to head some key institutions. On the basis of these observations, the following recommendations are made:

(a) That training courses that are slightly longer and more focused be organized for the consultants who have participated in the project and for new participants, particularly from non-governmental organizations and the private sector and that institutions be encouraged to send their staff to these training courses which should contribute to the strengthening key institutions that will be used in subsequent phases;

(b) That UNEP encourage the Government of Djibouti to reorganize the National Department of Meteorology, which currently has only one station at the Djibouti Airport, mainly involved in aeronautical meteorology. This is extremely urgent in view of the importance of this institution in the monitoring of climate change patterns and also in view of the recent privatization of the management of the airport;

(c) That in order to ensure sustainability and more credibility in the future, starting in phase II, the project involve more relevant institutions or departments instead of relying solely on the consultants, that the consultants identified be the leading investigators for the project and that greater importance be attached to the recommendations and findings of the investigators at the planning and policy level;

(d) That subsequent phases make better use of institutions such as the Center for Scientific Research for Development, which has qualified research staff, for in-depth studies.

C. Involvement of stakeholders

119. It is recommended that efforts be made to promote active involvement of all stakeholders from the public sector and greater participation of civil society. All available specialists should be invited. Participation should be based on competence rather than on availability and with the aim of consolidating a multidisciplinary team.

D. Closer and stronger involvement of the United Nations Environment Programme during phase II

120. It is recognized that the decentralization policies of UNEP empower the host country to take more responsibility for the implementation of the project. In order to ensure more participatory management practices at the national level, it is recommended that increased involvement of UNEP in project implementation be through the regular visit of a member of staff or a consultant, a United Nations volunteer or staff of the Regional Office for Africa (ROA) who would assist the Task Manager and ROA in backstopping several UNEP projects and conventions in the subregion. This would also ensure adherence to the monitoring and evaluation systems put in place.

E. Need for improved coordination and supervision at the national level

121. There is a need for more active coordination to boost the involvement of the relevant institutions. It is therefore recommended that during phase II, the National Climate Change Committee should play a more active and effective supervisory role. The Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment should assume a stronger coordination and leadership role that brings all actors together and facilitates links with IGAD and UNDP for the integration of future phases of this project into the overall development plan of the country.

F. Public awareness campaign

122. In order to speed up and facilitate the completion of activity 6, the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment had planned to strengthen public awareness during phase I. It is recommended that the Directorate launch, as planned, a massive and aggressive public awareness campaign targeting policy makers, planners and the general public. Illustrated publications of the various reports produced for the Initial National Communication and the production of materials such as newspaper articles, radio and television programmes, school television programmes and teaching aids should be made available and equipment should be acquired for use in the campaign. The funds remaining from phase I could be used for this purpose. It might be necessary to develop this as part of phase II.

G. The issue of data

123. Lack of appropriate data in all the sectors investigated (energy, transport, wastes, agriculture and livestock, etc.) was often a serious concern from the point of view of availability, accuracy, quality, consistency, etc. and for the creation of a comprehensive up-to-date database. On the basis of this observation, the following recommendations are made:

(a) That primary data collection be organized in the various sectors investigated to fill gaps in order to constitute accurate databases that will be used in future inventories, assessments or update exercises, that training be provided in this area that linkages be developed, if need, be with UNEP/DEWA and that a comprehensive documentation and information section be established at the Project Coordinator's office;

(b) That financial and technical support be provided to Djibouti to consolidate the project results and to develop the portfolio of concrete projects to be submitted for funding.

VI. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS

124. The project was successfully completed taking into account Djibouti's size and the available expertise. Existing data and data generated during the short project implementation period were used to complete the exercise. With the support of the authorities, the relevant institutions, the project research staff and UNEP/GEF, Djibouti has been able to generate some preliminary scientific and technical information and data on the possible impacts of climate change on the country. The project has provoked reflection on possible measures and strategies useful for sensitizing policy makers and planners to take appropriate measures to mitigate these impacts to ensure the sustainable development of the country while at the same time complying with the requirements of the Convention on Climate Change.

125. A great deal of work, however, remains to be done to refine the data and to develop strategies and policies, including capacity-building and coordination of action in order to increase awareness for effective and efficient action and to achieve the objectives of the Convention on Climate Change.

Annex 1

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR THE EVALUATION OF THE
UNEP/GEF SUBPROJECT GF/2200-97-58

(Enabling Activities for the preparation of Initial National Communication
Related to UNFCCC – Djibouti)

Under the guidance of the Chief of the Evaluation and Oversight Unit and in close collaboration with the UNEP Task Manager for Climate Change Enabling Activities (CCEA), the evaluator shall undertake an evaluation of the UNEP/GEF subproject "Djibouti: Enabling Activities for the Preparation of Initial National Communications Related to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) GF/2200-97-58"). This evaluation will be conducted during the period 1 September 2002 - 30 October 2002.

I. BACKGROUND

The project to be evaluated is being implemented internally by the UNEP Task Manager of Climate Change Enabling Activities and externally by the Department of Environment, Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development. This project provided the financial assistance necessary for the following activities:

(a) Development of the national greenhouse gas inventory to the 1994 base year;

(b) Identification and assessment of mitigation options;

(c) Development of a comprehensive vulnerability assessment for various sectors;

(d) Identification of stage I adaptation options;

(e) Building of capacity to integrate climate change concerns into planning;

(f) Providing public awareness and other information.

II. SCOPE OF MONITORING AND EVALUATION

The scope of the evaluation will cover the following activities that UNEP undertook to implement this project (preparation of the initial national communication):

(a) The consultant will compare the planned outputs of the project to the actual outputs and assess the steps taken to follow up in the country in order to maintain the capacity built;

(b) The consultant will also highlight the lessons learned from the implementation of pending activities in the area of climate change and assess the appropriateness of this project in meeting the longer-term objectives of UNEP, GEF and the Convention on Climate Change;

(c) The consultant will review the national institutional and technical capacity built by the UNEP/GEF project and the linkages established with related ongoing activities in the country;

(d) The consultant will recommend corrective and other practical steps required to strengthen and to improve the institutional framework, specifically to ensure successful implementation of the following activities:

(i) Phase II Climate Change Enabling Activities;

(ii) Preparation of National Adaptation Programmes of Action (NAPAs);

(iii) Participation in regional climate change projects such as capacity-building for systematic observation systems.

III. TERMS OF REFERENCE

(a) Analyse the quality and usefulness of the planned and current project outputs and determine how these contribute to the attainment of the results and overall objectives identified in the approved project proposal in meeting its commitments under the Convention on Climate Change. He/she should determine whether the project has been able to respond to the identified needs and problems in Djibouti;

(b) Measure the impact of the planned and current results of the first activity on the preparation of the initial national communication to the Convention on Climate change. This should also include a determination of the usefulness of the results to GEF-funded "Enabling Activities to Prepare National Communications to the UNFCCC" projects and consult the National Climate Change Committee (NCCC) chaired by the Department of Environment and made up of representatives of the National Department of Meteorology, the Ministry of Agriculture, the Ministry of Interior, the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Education and the private sector, including non-governmental organizations;

(c) Assess the quality of the consultants used in the implementation of the various project components, identify the lessons learned and make recommendations on how such involvement could be improved;

(d) Assess the role the project played in building the capacity of the participating national institutions in the area of reporting to the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Climate Change and assess the long-term sustainability of the benefits of this capacity-building;

(e) Determine the future assistance required from UNEP and GEF, particularly in ensuring successful implementation of the GEF-funded projects identified in section II that will start soon, identify the lessons learned and make recommendations that might improve the delivery of similar assistance in similar projects;

(f) Review the adequacy of the national and international monitoring and evaluation systems developed to supervise and implement the project and, on the basis of the lessons learned, make recommendations that could improve current procedures related to monitoring and evaluation;

(g) Review the effectiveness of the institutional structure and the management and financial systems which played an important role in the implementation of the project, investigating the staffing, administrative arrangements and operational mechanisms with emphasis on coordination within and outside of UNEP and solicit the views of relevant UNEP staff members on the usefulness of the project in enhancing the work of UNEP and GEF in the area of climate change;

(h) Identify any technical and operational constraints encountered during project implementation, including those which contributed to delays in the implementation of the approved work plan and identify further actions required by UNEP and the national executing agency to overcome the constraints and any appropriate alternative measures that need to be taken;

(i) Identify and assess any measures that the national institutions have initiated to integrate the results and recommendations of the initial national communication into national policy-making and planning. Make specific recommendations regarding follow-up measures that would enable longer-term benefits and sustainability of project activities;

(j) Determine the potential contribution of the project to the furthering of the objectives of the relevant global, regional and national environmental assessments, policy frameworks and action plans and to strengthen the Convention on Climate Change;

(k) Determine whether the actual results of the project compare with the long-term and short-term results identified in the project document and what needs to be done further;

(l) Determine the extent to which gender considerations were incorporated into the various technical and operational aspects of the project;

(m) Propose concrete suggestions or recommendations to the national executing agency and UNEP and assist them in undertaking them as appropriate.

IV. FORMAT OF THE EVALUATION REPORT

The evaluator will be in constant touch with the national executing agency and UNEP and provide at least weekly reports until the finalization of all project activities. The evaluator will also prepare his/her report in the form of:

(a) A concise summary (4 pages);

(b) A detailed evaluation report (about 30 pages) addressing sections II and III.

V. RATING OF THE SUCCESS OF THE PROJECT

The success of the implementation of the project will be rated on a scale of 1 to 5, 1 being the highest rating and 5 being the lowest. The evaluation rating will be based on a scale of 1-5, 1 being the highest rating and 5 being the lowest. The following items will be considered for rating purposes:

(a) Timeliness - how the project met the schedules and implementation timetable indicated in the project document;

(b) Achievement of results and objectives which will include:

(i) Attainment of outputs;

(ii) Completion of activities;

(iii) Project executed within the budget;

(iv) Impact created by the project;

(v) Sustainability;

(vi) Major problems faced and resolved successfully by the project.

Each of the items should be rated separately and the following rating system is to be applied:

1 = Excellent	(90 - 100 per cent achievement)
2 = Very Good	(75 - 89 per cent " " ")
3 = Good	(60 - 74 per cent" " ")
4 = Satisfactory	(50 - 59 per cent " " ")
5 = Unsatisfactory	(49 per cent and below " ")

V. SCHEDULE OF THE EVALUATION

The evaluation should begin on 1September 2002 and last for a period of two months. While conducting the evaluation, the consultant should communicate by telephone or e-mail with the UNEP headquarters in Nairobi to discuss the project with the relevant staff in UNEP, i.e., the Division for Policy Development and Law (UNEP/DPDL), the UNEP/GEF Coordination Unit and the UNEP Evaluation and Oversight Unit.

The consultant will discuss aspects of the project with the National Project Coordinator, selected members of NCCC and the staff of the Enabling Activities Project of Djibouti.

The consultant will submit the draft evaluation report by 30 September 2002. UNEP Climate Change Enabling Activities and the UNEP/GEF Coordination Unit will provide written comments on the draft evaluation report to the consultant through UNEP Evaluation and Oversight Unit by 11 October 2002.

The consultant will incorporate these comments and present a final version of the evaluation report to UNEP in English by 20 October 2002. This report should be presented in written form and on a diskette in MSWord format. The core report should not exceed 30 pages. All Annexes should be typed.

VI. THE CONSULTANT

The consultant should preferably be on the GEF/Scientific and Technical Advisory Panel Roster of Experts or be included in the database of evaluation consultants in the Evaluation and Oversight Unit, has an advanced university degree in a relevant discipline and has demonstrated expertise in the area of climate change and GEF projects. Previous experience in the evaluation of United Nations programmes or projects will be an advantage. The candidate should have at least ten years experience in the field of climate change or in a related environmental field.

Key contacts at UNEP headquarters:

Mr. Ravi SHARMA
Task Manager, Climate Change Enabling Activities, Division of Policy Development and Law (DPDL),
Tel.: (254-2) 624215
E-mail: ravi.sharma@unep.org

Mr. Ahmed DJOGHLAF
Executive Coordinator
Global Environment Facility
Scientific and Technical Advisory Panel, UNEP/GEF-STAP,
Tel.: (254-2) 624166
E-mail: ahmed.djoghlaf@unep.org

Mr. Segbedzi NORGBEY
Acting Chief, Evaluation and Oversight Unit (EOU)
Tel.: (254-2) 624181
E-mail: segbedzi.norgbey@unep.org

Annex II

DOCUMENTS PROVIDED FOR THE EVALUATION

1. The terms of reference.

2. Assistance to Selected non-Annex 1 Parties for the Preparation of Initial National Communications: Umbrella Project Document GF/2200-97-16.

3. Djibouti: Enabling Activities for the Preparation of Initial National Communication Related to UNFCCC: Project Document GF/2200-97-58.

4. GF/2200-97-58/Revision O1.

5. GF/2200-97-58/Revision O2.

6. Quarterly progress and financial reports as at 30 September 1999, 31 December 1999, 30 June 2000, 30 September 2000 and 31 December 2000.

7. Initial National Communication of Djibouti: Report on hard copy and on CD-ROM.

8. *Al-Sanbouk,* a quarterly newsletter of PERSGA.

9. Centre for Scientific Research for Development brochure.

10. Centre for Scientific Research for Development bulletin.

11. Common Country Assessment (CCA): The 2002 UNDP Office Report on Djibouti.

Annex III

LIST OF PERSONS MET IN DJIBOUTI

Mr. Moussa Ahmed Hassan	Project Coordinator
Mr. Mohamed Ali Moumin	Director of Environment
Mr. Dini Abdallah	Deputy Director of Environment
Mr. Nasser Abdi	PERSGA
Mr. Jalludin Mohamed	Director of the National Curriculum Development Centre
Mr. Nabil Mohammed	Director of Life Sciences
Mr. Said Ismail Awaleh	Director of Earth Sciences (Renewable energy)
Abdourahimin Yassor	National Meteorology Department
Mohammed Ahmed	National Meteorology Department
Loita Abbas	Djibouti Electricity
Aouled Djama	Department of Sanitation
Mrs. Yasmin Ahmed Moussa	Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development Vulnerability and adaptation/coastal area
Abdallah Barkat	Department of Livestock and Fisheries
Mohammed Ali Hussein	Vulnerability and adaptation coastal area Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development
Ahmed Fouad	Renewable Energy, Ministry of Energy
Mrs. Juliet Kamara	IGAD documentation
Behre	IGAD – Biodiversity
Aboubaker Douale Wais	Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development
Hamid Mohamed Aden	Director, National Curriculum Development Centre
Said Mohamed Barkat	National Curriculum Development Centre
Mme Mbaranga Gasarabwe	UNDP Representative

Annex IV

SCHEDULE OF VISITS BY THE CONSULTANT DURING HIS TRIP TO DJIBOUTI (12-19 SEPTEMBER 2002)

Thursday	12/09/02	P.M.	Arrival in Djibouti Met by Moussa Ahmed Hassan (the Project Coordinator)
Friday	13/09/02	A.M.	Discussion with Moussa
Saturday	14/08/02	A.M.	Briefing session at the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment with the Director, Deputy Director and the Project Coordinator
		P.M.	Discussion at the Centre for Scientific Research for Development - Director - Directors of various institutes
Sunday	15/09/02	A.M.	Discussions/visit of the National Meteorological Station at the Djibouti Airport
		P.M.	Discussion/briefing with the members of the various teams/consultants at the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment.
Monday	16/09/02	A.M	Discussions with Oosman Saad Director, National Meteorological Station, Airport Brief visit to UNDP
Tuesday	17/09/02	A.M.	Discussions with Mr. Fouad, in charge of renewable energy sources at the Ministry of Energy
		P.M	Discussion with the UNDP Representative
Wednesday	18/09/02	A.M.	Trip to Holl Holl Refugee Camp with Dr. Nabil Mohamed
		P.M	Discussions at the IGAD secretariat
Thursday	19/9/02	A.M.	Wrap-up discussions at the Ministry of Housing, Town Planning, Environment and Regional Development with the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry
		P.M.	Discussions with the Director of the National Curriculum Development Centre Visit to the National Curriculum Development Centre
		P.M	Departure to Nairobi

Annex V

LIST OF CONSULTANTS

MINISTRY OF HOUSING, TOWN PLANNING, ENVIRONMENT
AND REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT

The Initial National Communication of the Republic of Djibouti was prepared by the Project Management Team in the Directorate General of Regional Development and Environment with the contribution of the consultants and national experts.

National Project Coordinator GF/2200-97-58

M. Moussa Ahmed

National consultants

M. Jalludin Mohamed

M. Loita Abass (energy) (Djibouti Electricity)

M. Mohamed Moussa Ibrahim (agriculture and forestry)

M. Abdallah Barkhat (agriculture and forestry) (Development Livestock and Fisheries)

M. Aouled Djama (wastes) (Department of Sanitation)

M. Abdourahman Youssouf Nour (climate change scenarios)

Mme Yasmine Ahmed Moussa (coastal areas) Ministry of Environment

M. Mohamed Ali Houssein (coastal areas) Vulnerability and adaptation

M. Nasser Djama Adbi (marine ecosystems)

M. Moussa Omar Youssouf (terrestrial ecosystems)

Annex VI

STUDIES UNDERTAKEN UNDER THE PROJECT

1. Greenhouse gas inventory and reduction studies

Energy - Loita Abass

Transport - Hamid Mohamed Aden

Forestry - Abdallah Barkad and Mohamed Moussa

Wastes/sanitation - Aouled

2. Climate change vulnerability and adaptation studies

Climate change scenarios	Adbourahman Y., National Meteorology Department
Vulnerability and adaptation study of the coastal area	Yasmine Ahmed Moussa, Mohamed Ali Housssein
Marine and terrestrial ecosystems and climate change	Nasser Djama Abdi and Moussa Omar Youssouf
Vulnerability study on the water resources of Djibouti	Mr. Jalludin Mohamed: Institut Supérieur d'Etudes et de Recherches Scientifiques et Techniques (Higher Institute of Scientific and Technical Studies and Research) (National Centre for Scientific Research for Development)
